

Independent Expert Evaluation of Bus Drivers
in Comparison to their Counterparts in the Light
Rail System

Kevin Duffy

August 2019

Table of Contents

<i>Independent Expert Evaluation of Bus Drivers in Comparison to their Counterparts in the Light Rail System</i>	0
<i>Part 1</i>	4
1. <i>Introduction</i>	4
2. <i>Objectives</i>	4
3. <i>Terms of Reference</i>	4
4. <i>Methodology</i>	6
5. <i>The roles</i>	7
6. <i>Role Profile of Bus Driver</i>	7
7. <i>Role Profile of a Light Rail Driver</i>	10
8. <i>Recruitment – Bus Driver</i>	13
9. <i>Recruitment – Light Rail Driver</i>	16
10. <i>Educational Requirements</i>	16
11. <i>Health Standards</i>	16
12. <i>Licence Requirements</i>	17
13. <i>Training</i>	17
14. <i>Training content – Dublin Bus</i>	18
15. <i>Training Content – Transdev</i>	22
16. <i>Ongoing Annual Training – Bus Driver</i>	26

17. Ongoing Annual Training – Tram Driver	27
18. Responsibilities – Interaction with Customers.....	28
19. Legal Requirements and Consequences	28
20. Health Effects upon Bus Drivers of Working in a High Risk Environment.....	29
Part 2	31
21. Evaluation of Roles.....	31
22. Skills	32
23. Physical or mental requirements.....	32
24. Responsibilities	33
25. Working Conditions.....	34
26. Other Features of the Respective Roles.....	35
27. Recruitment Process	35
28. Educational Requirements.....	35
29. Health Standards	36
30. Licence Requirements.....	36
31. Training Period	36
32. Training Topics.....	36
33. Ongoing Annual Training	37
34. Legal Requirements	37
35. Penalty Points / Insurance Risks	38
36. Health Effects.....	38
37. Overall Conclusion.....	39
Part 3	40

38. Pay and Conditions of Employment	40
39. Overtime	40
40. Sunday Premium / Rostering Arrangements.....	41
41. Working Hours	41
42. Bonus	42
43. Annual Leave.....	42
44. Maternity Leave, Paternity Leave	42
45. Pensions	42
46. Death in Service	43
47. Sickness Benefit / Welfare Scheme	43
48. Assault Pay Scheme	44
49. Income Continuance.....	44
50. Travel Concessions	44
51. Pay	45
Table 1 – Pay of Bus Drivers / Tram Drivers	46
52. Light Rail Tram Drivers Bonus Scheme	47
Table 2: Employment Conditions and Benefits (Other than Core Pay and Overtime).....	47
53. Conclusion in Relation to Pay and Conditions	49
Part 4	51
Summary of Conclusions	51

Part 1

1. Introduction

- 1.1. This report provides the results of a comparative examination of the roles, responsibilities and conditions of employment of Bus Drivers employed by Dublin Bus and those of Tram Drivers employed on the Dublin Light Rail System (LUAS). The examination was undertaken on behalf of Dublin Bus, SIPTU and NBRU.
- 1.2. The examination was commissioned pursuant to an agreement reached between the parties at the WRC.
- 1.3. The relevant term of the agreement is as follows: -

“In relation to the Trade Unions’ contention that the terms and conditions of Dublin Bus Drivers have fallen behind their counterparts in the light rail system, the parties agree to engage in a job evaluation exercise carried out by a mutually agreed independent expert. The terms of reference, which should include a conclusion date, will be agreed by the relevant parties. The outcome will be considered by all relevant stakeholders”

2. Objectives

- 2.1. The stated objective of this exercise is as follows: -

To undertake a comprehensive Job Analysis and Job Evaluation of both Dublin Bus Drivers and Drivers in the Light Rail system.

3. Terms of Reference

- 3.1. The terms of reference for the examination, as agreed between the parties are as follows: -

Carry out a literature review of available information related to the role of a bus driver and a light rail driver.

The following documentation to be considered:

1. Role Profile
2. Recruitment
3. Educational requirements
4. Health standards
5. Licence requirement
6. Training duration
7. Training topics
8. Ongoing annual training
9. Ongoing legislative Training
10. Responsibility's
11. Interaction with Customers
12. Legal Requirements/rules of the road for bus drivers
13. Penalty points/increased insurance risk
14. Health effects upon bus drivers of working in a high-risk environment

Carry out a literature review of available information related to terms and conditions of employment for the role of bus driver and a light rail driver.

1. Salary scales
2. Normal weekly hours of work
3. Shift pay if any
4. Premium payment Sunday

5. Premium payment Public Holiday
6. Overtime Pay Rates for all day types
7. Annual Bonus
8. Sickness pay scheme
9. Annual leave entitlements
10. Other leave entitlements
11. Pension scheme contributions/benefits
12. Spouse/partner benefits
13. Death in service
14. Income continuance scheme
15. Travel facilities
16. Medical GP Welfare Scheme
17. Work rosters/Maximum duty spread at a most basic level
18. Other benefits.

- 3.2. The original date on which this exercise was to be completed was fixed at 31st October 2018. However, for a variety of reasons it was not possible to meet that deadline. A revised deadline of 31st August 2019 was subsequently agreed.

4. Methodology

- 4.1. The terms of reference provide that the evaluation was to be conducted on the basis of a literature review of available information in relation to the role of a bus driver and that of a light rail driver. All of the documentation with which I was furnished by the parties has been considered and comparatively analysed. I also sought and obtained

further information on matters coming within the terms of reference, from the parties and externally.

5. The roles

- 5.1. At a most basic level the role of a Bus Driver and that of a Light Rail Driver are similar. They both involve responsibility for the safe transportation of fare paying passengers on a fixed route in different forms of public transport conveyance. Both buses and trams travel on the open road, although, unlike buses, parts of the routes on which trams operate pass through dedicated off-road tracks to which other vehicular traffic does not have access. Except where dedicated bus lanes are provided on the public road, buses must share the road with other forms of traffic and must traverse that traffic safely, particularly in stopping at and leaving bus stops. Trams travel on fixed tracks and there is no requirement, or ability, to manoeuvre the tram around other traffic at stopping points, or otherwise.
- 5.2. It is also obvious that bus drivers are responsible for interacting with passengers to a significantly greater degree than their counterparts on the light rail system. These are significant factors that impact on the degree of responsibility and mental effort required by drivers in the respective categories.
- 5.3. These are factors that are reflected in the different role profile / job description of a bus driver and that of a light rail driver.

6. Role Profile of Bus Driver

- 6.1. The principle responsibilities of a driver employed by Dublin Bus are set out in a document created by the company and dated September 2015. It provides: -

Role and purpose

The role of the professional driver is to deliver passengers to their destinations safely, on time and in a courteous manner.

Dublin Bus drivers deliver a quality customer service by operating buses to agreed schedules in a safe and efficient manner and interacting courteously with customers.

Working relationships with:-

- Local depot management/supervisory team
- Local operations and engineering teams
- Central Controllers
- External customers and members of the public

Summary areas of responsibility

Safety

- Operate service in a safe and efficient manner
- Comply with all health and safety procedures and ensure procedures are followed as outlined in the Safety Management System
- Carry out first-use checks

Customer service

- Provide high standard of customer service at all times
- Ensure service operates to schedule so as to provide reliable service
- Operate ramps to facilitate customers with accessibility needs
- Provide customer information in relation to service and destinations

Reporting and communication

- Conduct driver first use bus check
- Log and report defects on buses
- Complete written reports in relation to incidents and accidents
- Use on bus technology to record, monitor and communicate

Fare collection and ticket issue

- Collection of fares, issue of tickets. Ticket validation

- Accounting for passengers by ensuring fare payment or ticket/travel pass validity

Competencies

The following competencies represent the set of knowledge, skills and abilities required for the position.

Safety awareness

- Aware of safety priorities relating to driving
- Aware of risks and takes action to prevent emergencies
- Ability to deliver service safely, reliably and efficiently

Resilience

- Ability to remain focused and calm under pressure
- Awareness of own stress triggers and how to manage them

Commitment

- Demonstrates responsible and dependable behaviour
- Committed to organisational objectives and can be relied on to carry out duties as instructed

Customer service

- Takes pride in delivering a high-quality service
- Strives to continually improve customer service
- Interacts well with customers and understands customer needs
- Delivers professional high standard customer service at all times

Interpersonal skills

- Ability to interact effectively with others, customers, colleagues etc.
- Treats others with courtesy, sensitivity, respect and demonstrates diplomacy in dealing with people
- Fluency in written and spoken English language as appropriate to requirements of role

Teamwork / Flexibility

- Works effectively with others and maintains good working relationships
- Able and willing to work on different shift patterns

Other requirements

Application stage

- Category “D” driver theory test certificate – category “D” driving permit
- Successful completion of CPC case study theory test
- Two years car driving experience on a full B licence.

Recruitment stage

- Pass written assessment stage
- Pass preliminary driving skills test and competency based interview
- Pass pre-employment medical examination

Selection stage

- Pass driver training programme
- Pass category “D” driving test and CPC practical test
- Work late shifts on a 4-day week from Thursday to Monday (with opportunity to progress to 5-day week with rotating shifts)

7. Role Profile of a Light Rail Driver

- 7.1. The principal duties and responsibilities of a light rail driver are set out in a document produced by the operator of the system (Transdev) entitled “Job Description – Tram Driver

This document provides as follows: -

Job Title

Tram Driver

Reporting to

Service delivery Manager

Responsibilities

As a safety critical role, Luas Tram Drivers will contribute effectively to the safe operation of the Luas light rail system in the following areas:

- Safely operating a Luas light rail vehicle in passenger service by adhering to all Transdev Dublin safety and operational procedures.
- Delivering first class customer service to Luas customers through face to face interaction and the use of public announcements.

All Tram Drivers must pass a full and complete medical assessment in order to ensure the highest levels of safety are maintained.

Key Accountabilities

1. Operate a Luas light rail vehicle in accordance with all Transdev Dublin safety and operational procedures.
2. Drive trams taking particular account of all permissible, temporary and emergency speed restrictions.
3. Ensure full compliance with the Transdev Dublin drugs and alcohol policy.
4. Obey all fixed signals and hand signals.
5. Report fit for duty on time in order to be fully prepared to drive trams.

Keep in contact with Team Leaders, especially in times of disruption.

6. Be presented in full uniform and carry with you all publications and equipment necessary in order to meet the requirements of Transdev Dublin's standards and code of conduct.
7. Communicate effectively in accordance with company radio protocol with the Central Control Room regarding the transmission of verbal messages.
8. Deal with degraded mode operations according to Transdev Dublin's standards and other relevant publications.
9. Complete written reports including incident reports (SCIR's) in accordance with those required in the Transdev Dublin Safety Manual as soon as reasonably practicable.
10. Drive trams with regard to punctuality and customer comfort.
11. Ensure that customers are advised, either directly regarding tram running matters or indirectly through the control room.

Knowledge

- Education: Minimum of leaving Certificate level of education.
- Operational procedures: Sound knowledge of all Transdev Dublin operational procedures.
- Driving licence: A full clean driving licence.

Skills

- Safety: Being safety conscious at all times is of critical importance.

- Attendance: Excellent attendance and timekeeping record.
- Communications: Must be capable of effective written and verbal communication as well as having excellent interpersonal skills.

Experience

- Team work: Working as part of a highly productive team to deliver a first-class transport solution for Dublin.
- Technical ability: An excellent technical ability regarding fault finding.

8. Recruitment – Bus Driver

- 8.1. Dublin Bus utilises a multi stage recruitment process to fill vacancies for professional bus drivers. It comprises: -

First Stage

The first stage in the process involves the identification of vacancies and obtaining sanction from the Head of Human Resources and Development on the number of drivers to be recruited. The role profile for the position is reviewed and updated where necessary. The role profile is then subject to approval by the Head of Human Resources and Development. An application is then updated, where necessary, in agreement with an On-line Executive. The advertisement is then placed through a number of media platforms and in the national newspapers. It is also placed in Intro employment offices.

Applications are made on-line. The application forms are downloaded and details of candidates are input on a Excel database. These details include the candidates name, address, gender and the basic criteria for the post. A decision is then taken on the number of candidates to be short-listed and the proposed numbers to be allocated for training at the end of the process.

A short-listing process is then undertaken against predetermined shortlisting criteria recorded on a standard form. Candidates who are not selected for progression to the next stage of the process are informed accordingly.

Second Stage

The second stage of the process entails a reading and writing assessment of candidates, a numerical test of basic calculations, a psychometric test. The writing assessment, numerical test and psychometric test is undertaken on an 'assessment day', to which candidates are invited, at an external venue.

The reading and writing assessments are based on possible scenarios involving an accident or incident that could arise involving the operation of a bus service. The numeracy test involves basic calculations relating to bus fares. The psychometric test is linked to the profile competencies required for the bus driver role. This test is used to explore areas of competency that require further exploration at the interview stage. Candidates are not short-listed on the basis of the psychometric test alone.

During the assessment day, identification is also verified, and a declaration of identity form is completed.

Third Stage

The third stage of the selection process involves the checking of documents, a driving skills assessment and a competency-based interview.

Candidates who progress to this stage are required to report to a training Executive and present the following documents for examination: -

- Driving Licence
- D learner permit
- CPC case study test
- Passport and birth certificate

Each candidate is required to complete an access to personal information form supplying the name and contact details of two referees, one of whom must be the candidate's most recent employer. Candidates are then required to undertake a driving skills assessment test conducted by an RSA approved driving instructor. This test involves a one hour drive on a predetermined route. Candidates who hold a 'B' licence are assessed driving a car and 'D' licence holders are assessed driving a bus. Only those candidates who pass the assessment progress to the interview stage.

Interviews are conducted by a member of the HR staff and an Area Operations Manager. They are competency based and questions are directed on examining candidates on the following competencies: -

- Safety awareness,
- Resilience,
- Commitment,
- Customer service,
- Interpersonal skills,
- Teamwork and flexibility

This process involves recording interview notes and the completion of scoring sheets.

Fourth and Final Stage

This stage involves checking references against a structured questionnaire. This process is undertaken by telephone. Candidates are then required to undergo a medical examination carried out by the CIE Group Chief Medical Officer. This examination is for the purpose of determining the candidate's fitness for the role of professional bus driver. If a candidate is found to be unfit, he or she is excluded at that stage.

Following the completion of all stages in the process, a final review of remaining candidates is undertaken and offers of employment are made. Those selected are then placed in training.

Initial appointment is on a 12 month probation period, during which the performance of the driver is reviewed (see detailed review process below)

9. Recruitment – Light Rail Driver

- 9.1. The recruitment process for a Tram Driver is not documented. From the information provided to me, the selection process operated by Transdev is comparatively more straightforward than that followed by Dublin Bus.
- 9.2. Approval to fill vacancies must be obtained from the Company's Managing Director. Advertisements are placed and application can be made on an on-line form. Applicants are required to nominate two referees. Short-listing of candidates takes place on the basis of the information provided on the form by reference to the minimum criteria prescribed for the post.
- 9.3. Candidates who are short-listed are interviewed using a competency-based interview method. Those selected at interview are then required to undergo a pre-employment medical examination. References are then checked, and a final decision is made on offers of employment. Those employed undergo a probationary period of six months, with a review after three months.

10. Educational Requirements

- 10.1. Dublin Bus does not specify a formal minimum level of educational attainment for employment as a professional bus driver. Transdev requires applicants for employment as a light rail driver to have attained a leaving certificate as a minimum level of educational attainment.

11. Health Standards

- 11.1. Both Dublin Bus and Transdev require a minimum level of medical fitness for employment in a driving capacity. Prospective employees of both Companies are required to undergo a medical examination before being offered employment. Both categories of driver are also required to remain medically fit to undertake their duties during the continuance of their employment.

12. Licence Requirements

- 12.1. Candidates for employment as a professional bus driver must hold a full category 'D' driving licence and a Certificate of Professional Competency (CPC), or a valid 'B' licence (car and light van), with no endorsements, for a minimum of two years. The necessity to hold a CPC is a requirement of EU law for all bus drivers. Candidates for employment must have passed the Driver Theory Test for a category 'D' licence and hold a category 'D' driver permit. They must also have successfully completed the Bus Driver CPC Case study Test. During the continuance of their employment bus drivers must hold a valid category D licence and have their CPC periodically renewed.
- 12.2. Candidates for employment as a light rail driver must have two years relevant driving experience and hold a full category 'B' driving licence without endorsements or penalty points. The statutory requirement to hold a CPC does not apply to light rail drivers nor are they required to hold a category 'D' licence.
- 12.3. Light Rail Drivers are required to hold a category "B" licence during the continuance of their employment.

13. Training

- 13.1 Initial training provided by Dublin Bus for newly recruited bus drivers is provided 'off-the job' in the Company's dedicated training centre and practical driving instruction on the open road. It consists of 13 modules. It extends over a six-week period, in the case of those holding a 'B' licence and a four-week period for those holding a 'D' licence. The longer training period for those holding a 'B' licence is to enable them sufficient time to acquire a 'D' licence, which is a statutory requirement for their role as a professional bus driver. Following this initial training, Bus Drivers then proceed to a further phase consisting of a mentoring programme.
- 13.2. The initial training period for a light rail driver is 8 weeks and is a combination of off-the job' training and practical 'on-the job' training involving driving a tram under the supervision of what is described as a 'minder'.

- 13.3. Newly recruited Light Rail Drivers spend the first 4 weeks with a driver trainer getting familiar with the trams and the infrastructure on both lines and in all three depots. For weeks 5, 6 and 7 the trainees are accompanied by Driver Mentors and carry out the majority of the driving on a normal duty. Each trainee is given a mixture of early & late duties (daylight/night-time driving etc.) and they also get an even spread of duties across both Red & Green lines.
- 13.4. The 8th week of the course is mainly made up of various assessments that the new drivers are required to undertake including driving assessments, written assessment and fault fixing assessments. A trainee is certified as a competent Tram Driver having successfully completed all assessments.

14. Training content – Dublin Bus

- 14.1. The training content of the Dublin Bus programme consists of the following modules: -

Module 1: Introduction

- Welcome and registration; outline of programme
- Driving test application form
- Mentoring programme
- On-going assessment and reviews; Driver Quality Monitoring
- 'Every Journey Matters' instructional DVD
- Organisational background
- Uniform issue

Module 2: Driving standards

- First use check; cockpit drill; space around vehicle; blind spots
- Road sharing attitude; vulnerable road users; identification of hazards
- Completing Accident Report form
- Depot specific routes/test route
- Driving skills; Route training and familiarity; operating ramp; keeping even headway; vehicle type familiarity
- On-bus equipment; PRESSIT (on-bus display of adherence to schedule); Radio; PA announcements
- D licence instruction

- DOE driving licence application/type training
- On-road driving
- National Driving Licence Service – application for full D licence

Module 3: Role of the bus driver

- Responsibilities and competencies required for role
- Road Traffic Act; Working Time Act
- Working day; report for work; attendance and punctuality; whole time employment; Employee Declaration form
- Safety in depot area; safety priorities
- Personal appearance and dress code
- Lost property

Module 4: Policies and procedures

- Rulebook; Employee handbook; Driver safety handbook; daily first use check
- Alcohol and Drugs policy
- CIÉ Protected Disclosures
- Core skills for bus drivers

Module 5: Advanced driving standards

- Rules and regulations
- Vehicle dimensions
- Driving in snow and ice
- Eco-driving; reduction of fuel consumption

Module 6: Risks and emergencies

- Safety awareness; Safety priorities; Driver safety handbook
- Dealing with accidents and emergencies; fire procedures
- Completing Accident Report form (recap)

Module 7: Central Control

- Site visit to Central Control, Broadstone
- Role of Central Control

- Public Service Contract; targets and penalties
- Even headway; centre doors; driver handover
- Reading schedules/duty sheets

Module 8: Customer service

- Customer Charter
- Customer loyalty ladder
- Communication; art of listening; turning negatives into positives
- Customer Service ambassador
- Dealing with difficult behaviour; dealing with complaints; dealing with conflict
- Social consciousness; Equality and Diversity (Equal Status Act); hidden disabilities; accessibility; racist incidents

Module 9: Tickets and on-bus technology

- Ticket machines; issue of tickets
- Fare types and categories
- Checking passes and pre-paid tickets; Leap Card procedures; passenger change; passengers unable to pay, accounting for fares
- Implications of shortages/surpluses; documentation of fare totals; procedures on failure of ticketing
- PRESSIT

Module 10: Wellbeing

- Nutrition
- Physical health; mental health
- Alcohol and drug awareness
- Driver fatigue

Module 11: Working with others

- Teamwork; working with the operations and engineering departments
- Dignity and respect policy
- Dealing with conflict
- Disciplinary and grievance policy
- Protection of children and vulnerable adults

- Social media policy

Module 12: Employee benefits

- Pension scheme
- Medical scheme
- Travel facilities
- Citybus Employees Credit Union
- Income continuance
- Employee Assistance Programme
- Education support scheme
- Sports and social clubs
- Canteen facilities
- Safe driving awards
- Attendance bonus

Module 13: Review of training

- Review of training programme and next steps
- Mentoring programme
- Driving skills assessment programme (Vigil Vanguard), including pre-drive check, first drive, review, second drive, review
- Depot specific routes
- Night driving
- Refreshers on first use check, cockpit drill, driving skills, Route training and familiarity, hazards, operating ramp, keeping even headway, vehicle type familiarity, on-bus equipment, PRESSIT, Radio, PA announcements

14.2. During the first 12 months of their employment, bus drivers are subject to continuing assessment and monitoring during which their suitability for appointment as permanent employees is determined. This process involves: -

- Participation in a mentoring programme
- Driver quality monitoring

- A four-month driving skills test and a stage 2 training programme in safety and customer care
 - A 4 month review of performance and attendance
 - An 8 month review of performance and attendance
 - An input on driving skills competence development
- 14.3. At both the 4 month and the 8 month review a decision is made on whether the employee is suitable to continue in employment.
- 14.4. At the end of the 12 month probation period the employee's overall performance is reviewed and a decision is taken on whether to appoint the employee as a permanent member of staff.

15. Training Content – Transdev

- 15.1. The training programme provided to newly recruited light rail drivers comprises the following elements: -

Week 1

- **Induction Day**
- Overview of Company
- Collective Agreement
- Health & Safety
Absence / Sick Pay / Annual Leave Disciplinary & Grievance Drug & Alcohol
- Fire Safety
- **Basic introduction to LUAS to include** – Description of both lines Description of both trams Responsibilities of a Tram Driver
- **Depot Tour** –
- Offices, facilities etc. Workshops
North & South aprons South Loop
- Storage Lanes
- **Review** -
- Workshops – pit lane, wheel lathe, crane, power lights etc.
Sand/Wash

Aprons

Storage lanes

- **Green Line Overview –**
- Balally crossover Beechwood crossover Stephens Green platform & procedure
- Sandyford Platforms B1
- **401 Tram Controls –**
- Cab controls (buttons, chimes, horn etc) Master Controller
Vigilance Device Drivers Key
- **Review of 401 Cab Controls**
- **Points & PPI's**
- Facing, Trailing
Manual, Motorised, Spring, Hand Lever
Different PPI signals
- **Review of Points & PPI's**
- **Infrastructure Training –**
- Rail – 4 foot, 6 foot etc. Loops – Function, location Signals –
Proceed, cluster, stop
- Speed Signs – PSR, TSR SI's.
- **Driving from storage lanes in & out of workshops both North & South**
- **AVLS & TCMS**
- Log in & out Partial log in & out Set destination Audio messages
TCMS screen Voltages
- **Radio Communication –**
- Overview of correct radio procedure.
Separate trainees into different rooms.
- Use designated radio channel to communicate back and forth (role play) with cooperation from CCR
- **Main Line Driving –**
- Route Knowledge Awareness of speed restrictions, stops, loops, signals etc.
- **Review of key areas 1st Week written exam**

Week 2

- **Depot Tour –**

- Offices, facilities etc. Workshops
Aprons
Storage Lanes Sand/Wash Avoidance Lane Delta
- Points/Hand thrown levers
- **Red Line Overview –**
- Tallaght platform & procedure
Blackhorse crossover Heuston extra platform Smithfield crossover
Abbey Street crossover Connolly platform & procedure
- **Review –**
- Workshops, pit lane, wheel lathe, power lights Aprons
Storage Lanes
Points
Sand/Wash
- **402 Tram Controls –**
- Cab controls Master Controller Vigilance Device
- **Review of 40 Cab Controls**
Exterior & Interior checks Storage lanes onto avoidance
- Sand/Wash
In & out of Workshops
- **Mainline Driving –**
- Route Knowledge Awareness of speed restrictions, signals, PPI's, loops etc.
- Hazard locations Depot Entry / Exit
- **Address by SIPTU Official**
- **Mainline Driving – (2 days)**
- Route Knowledge Awareness of speed restrictions, signals, PPI's, loops etc.
- Hazard locations Depot Entry / Exit
- **2nd Week assessment**

Week 3

- **Mainline Driving (full week)**
- Route Knowledge Awareness of speed restrictions, signals, PPI's, loops etc.
- Hazard locations
- Depot Entry / Exit

- **3rd Week assessment**

Week 4

- **Mainline Driving – (4 days)**
- **Tow / Push**
- Manual Coupling Electrical Coupling Safety Checks Uncoupling
- **Degraded Mode –**
- Brakes Isolation
Clear Door Obstruction TBCU Failure
Vigilance Device Failure Motor Bogie Isolation
- **Mainline Driving –**
- Route Knowledge
- **Sweep Run**
- **4th week assessment**

Week 5

- **Mainline Driving, with ‘Minder’ (all week)**

Week 6

- **Mainline Driving, with ‘Minder’ (all week)**

Week 7

- **Mainline Driving, with ‘Minder’ (all week)**

Week 8

- **Refresher training**
- **Tow / Push refresher training**
- **Degraded mode refresher training**
- **Tow / Push Assessment**
- **SM05 assessment**
- **Final written assessment**
- **SM05 assessment**
Tow / Push Assessment

16. Ongoing Annual Training – Bus Driver

- 16.1 All bus drivers participate in one days training each year to qualify them for the Certificate of Professional Competence (CPC) in accordance with EU Directive 2003/59/EC and Road Safety Authority approval. The CPC modules are as follows:

- The professional bus driver
- Minimising risks and managing emergencies
- Health and safety for the professional driver
- Control of the vehicle and eco driving techniques
- Role of the professional driver in the transport industry

Each year as part of the CPC programme all attendees receive an updated information leaflet which focuses on Accessibility issues and updates.

Driving Skills Assessment Programme (Vigil Vanguard) – a driving skills competence development programme is delivered to all drivers once every two years. This programme uses a video training system (Vigil Vanguard) to facilitate reflective learning and behavioural change. The training programme has been acknowledged by the Chartered Institute of Logistics and Transport and the Road Safety Authority for its innovative approach to driver skills training.

Customer Care one to one programme – a one to one customer care programme is delivered to any bus driver requiring refresher training specifically around customer care. The training uses a coaching approach and is delivered on a peer to peer basis by part-time trainers who are also bus drivers.

Refresher training – bus drivers who are returning to work following a long term absence attend the Training Centre for refresher training. The length of this training is determined based on the individual needs of the driver attending the training.

Corrective training – bus drivers who are part of the Driver Safety Programme (DSP) or who fail to meet the required standards of the Driver Quality Monitoring (DQM) programme attend the Training Centre for corrective driving training to ensure they then meet the required standards of Dublin Bus.

The purpose of the Driver Safety Programme is to identify bus drivers with high accident rates and identify the underlying reasons for the accidents. It is a consultative and interactive process with an emphasis on awareness, assistance and training, with an objective to foster a change to safer driving behaviour. Bus drivers who are part of the programme receive in-service coaching from a qualified instructor, and in-service monitoring of the performance of the driver over a route or portion of a route. Records are kept of all coaching and monitoring received by a bus driver.

Driver Quality Monitoring is a mechanism to assess the level of service that Dublin Bus drivers provide to our customers. Plain clothes monitoring takes place on bus drivers and is carried out by specifically trained assessors. Individual reports are provided for all monitoring assessments. In the event that a bus driver fails to meet the required standard they will attend the Training Centre for corrective training based on the monitoring assessment report.

Route training: As part of the new driver mentoring programme, drivers are provided with route training on selected nursery routes. Once they are allocated to a depot after completing the driver induction programme, they are then trained on other routes in their depot, as required.

Existing drivers are trained locally in their depot on new routes or changes to existing routes as required.

17. Ongoing Annual Training – Tram Driver

- 17.1. Tram Drivers receive a one day refresher training course each year delivered by a driver trainer. The content of the refresher training changes each year to incorporate any areas that are a cause of concern (Junctions / Defensive driving techniques etc.) in that particular year.
- 17.2. Drivers are continuously assessed by a team of assessors. There are 8 quarterly assessments over a two year period resulting in the re-certification of a driver at which time the continual assessment process commences again.

18. Responsibilities – Interaction with Customers

- 18.1. Bus drivers are responsible for ensuring that each passenger entering the bus pays the correct fare for their journey or are otherwise entitled to travel on the bus. This can also involve advising customers of the applicable fare stages. In the case of travel passes, they are also responsible for ensuring the validity of the pass in respect to the passenger presenting it. Apart from the revenue protection functions involved, this requires a degree of direct face-to face interaction with passengers.
- 18.2. No corresponding responsibility rests with a Tram Driver.
- 18.3. Bus drivers are also expected to interact well with customers and understand customer needs. This includes dealing with special needs of customers with disabilities or impairments. They are also responsible, where asked to do so, for advising customers on where to leave the bus, or make connections, so as to reach their intended destination.
- 18.4. No corresponding responsibility rests with a Tram Driver.
- 18.5. Bus drivers are also required to deal appropriately with anti-social or disruptive behaviour by passengers and contraventions of regulations applicable to passengers, including those relating to smoking or consuming alcohol on the bus.

19. Legal Requirements and Consequences

- 19.1. Like all other vehicular traffic, bus driving is governed by the Road Traffic Acts. As the roads intersect with the Tramway and Tram Drivers drive trams on the roads, their driving is also subject to the Road Traffic Acts. Bus driving is also regulated by the Organisation of Working Time Act 1997.
- 19.2. As with all other drivers, both bus and tram Drivers are personally liable for contraventions of the Road Traffic Acts committed in the course of their employment and are subject to such penalties as the law allows for any such contravention.

19.3. In addition, Tram Driving is governed by the Railway Safety Act 2005, (As amended by the European Union (Railway Safety) Regulations 2013 (S.I.444 of 2013) and Drivers are personally liable for any contraventions of that Act. This statute places an obligation on them regarding fitness for duty (section 112) and drug and alcohol testing together with other safety responsibilities.

19.4. Any penalties incurred by either Bus or Tram Drivers in the course of their employment can have serious consequences in terms of their personal driving. They are obliged to inform their insurers of any convictions incurred or penalty points imposed. This will inevitably impact on the cost of private insurance or their ability to change insurers

20. Health Effects upon Bus Drivers of Working in a High Risk Environment

20.1. I was provided with a report published by the ILO in 1996, entitled 'Bus Drivers: Occupational stress and stress prevention, by Professor M.A.J. Kompier, of the University of Mijmegem. I have also seen a report of a Joint Working Party on Stress and Health Study on OPO Bus Drivers in Dublin Bus. That report was published in 1997. The current relevance of these reports is diminished by the passage of time since their publication. Moreover, many stress factors identified have been addressed in the intervening period. Nonetheless, they confirm that the work of a bus driver is stressful and can lead to stress related illness, and other occupational illness amongst those following that occupation. I have no reason to believe that there has been any material change in that regard.

20.2. The ILO Report is a comprehensive document which draws on several similar studies undertaken internationally. It concludes that driving a bus should be regarded as an occupation with high risks for the health and well-being of those following that occupation. It characterises the work of a bus driver, as involving: -

- High and conflicting demands,
- Low autonomy
- Low support
- Ergonomic problems relating to the seating position and confined space in which the driver works,

- Threats and violence
- The demands of work schedules

20.3. On aspects of the job relating to stress and physical load, it identified the following hazards: -

- Fatigue,
- Tension,
- Mental overload,
- Muscolo-skeletal problems
- Stomach problems
- High blood pressure
- Sleeping complaints,
- High adrenalin levels

20.4. The report identified the following manifestations on the health of drivers

- High sickness and absenteeism
- High disability risk, due to psychological, muscolo-skeletal and cardiovascular problems

20.5. As previously stated, in the period since this report was published (1996) many initiatives have been taken by Dublin Bus to address and ameliorate the issues identified. However, they remain occupational hazards associated with the work of a bus driver.

20.6. I have been unable to find any similar report on the occupational hazards associated with tram driving.

Part 2

21. Evaluation of Roles

- 21.1. The stated objective of this exercise is to undertake a comprehensive Job Analysis and Job Evaluation of both Dublin Bus Drivers and Drivers in the Light Rail system.
- 21.2. In conducting that evaluation, I have adopted an approach analogous to that prescribed by various employment enactments for determining if different jobs are of equal or greater value (see, for example, section 5(2)(c) of the Protection of Employees (Fixed Term Work) Act 2003).
- 21.3. This approach involves examining, by reference to the documents with which I was provided and other information that I obtained, the various components of the jobs being evaluated by reference to such matters as: -
- Skill,
 - Physical or mental requirements,
 - Responsibility
 - Working conditions.
- 21.4. The competencies, training and qualifications necessary for the respective roles is also a material factor that is taken into consideration, as are the other aspects of both roles, identified in the terms of reference.
- 21.5. Although differently expressed, there is a broad similarity in most of the competencies that each category of driver is expected to possess and the functions that they are required to perform, which are identified in their respective role profile and job description. Both categories of driver are responsible for the safe operation of public transport vehicles. The core duty of both roles is to carry passengers safely and on time, while ensuring that they do not injure other road users or pedestrians. Many of the competencies required for both roles are directed at those imperatives.

22. Skills

22.1. Both bus Drivers and Tram Driver perform a safety critical role. Both require a high level of skill in safely driving their vehicles. While trams operate on the public road they do so on tracks. Stopping points are located along the track system. Bus drivers are required to traverse other traffic on most of the road network on which they operate.

22.2. Bus Drivers are also required to use eco driving techniques so as to minimise fuel usage and emissions

22.3. I have concluded that Bus Drivers are required to exercise a higher level of driving skill than that required for tram driving. This is indicated by the requirement on Bus Drivers to hold a category 'D' licence and to hold a CPC.

22.4. Both categories are required to use on-board technology. Bus drivers use on-bus technology to record, monitor and communicate. Tram drivers must remain in communication with the Central Control Room while driving. They must also observe fixed signals and observe temporary or emergency speed restrictions.

22.5. I have concluded that the skills required to exercise these functions are equal as between both categories

Bus Drivers are responsible for identifying, logging and reporting defects in the vehicles for which they are responsible and ensure that they comply with the requirements of the Road Traffic Acts. Tram Drivers are responsible for dealing with degraded mode operations in accordance with standard procedures.

22.6. I have concluded that the skills required to exercise these functions are equal as between both categories

23. Physical or mental requirements

23.1. There is no material difference in the physical effort required as between bus driving and tram driving. In terms of mental requirements, this criterion overlaps to a degree with that of skills and responsibility.

- 23.2. The requirement to share the public road with other vehicular traffic, cyclists and pedestrians, places additional demands of alertness on Bus Drivers. The requirement inherent in the role of a Bus Driver for face-to-face interaction with customers, sometimes in difficult or stressful circumstances, also places additional demands on this category of driver in terms of mental effort.
- 23.3. The requirement on a Bus Driver in respect to fare collection and the proper use of prepaid tickets and travel passes, is also a relevant consideration in assessing the comparative degree of mental effort as between both categories
- 23.4. I have concluded that the mental requirements inherent in the role of a Bus Driver are greater than those inherent in the role of a Tram Driver**

24. Responsibilities

- 24.1. The salient responsibility of both categories of driver is to drive safely and observe all statutory and company requirements in the course of their duties.
- 24.2. There is, however, a material difference between both categories in relation to revenue collection and accountability. Bus drivers are responsible for ensuring that each passenger entering the bus pays the correct fare or are otherwise entitled to travel on the bus. In the case of travel passes, they are also responsible for ensuring the validity of the pass in respect to the passenger presenting it. Apart from the revenue protection functions involved, this requires a degree of direct face-to face interaction with passengers. No corresponding responsibility rests with a tram driver.
- 24.3. Bus drivers are also expected to interact well with customers and understand customer needs. This includes dealing with special needs of customers with disabilities or impairments. They may also be required to advise customers on where to leave the bus, or make connections, so as to reach their intended destination.
- 24.4. No corresponding responsibility rests with a Tram Driver.

- 24.5. Bus drivers are also required to deal appropriately with anti-social or disruptive behaviour by passengers and contraventions of regulations applicable to passengers, including those relating to smoking or consuming alcohol on the bus.
- 24.6. These factors, taken in combination, place a materially broader range of responsibilities on Bus Drivers.
- 24.7. I have concluded that the range and nature of responsibilities attaching to the role of a Bus Driver are greater than those attaching to the role of a Tram Driver**

25. Working Conditions

- 25.1. This criterion relates to the physical conditions under which the respective categories of work is performed and the demands placed, by those condition, on those performing the work.
- 25.2. The place of work, for both categories, is the vehicle that they drive. Both work in confined areas of the vehicle and are required to remain seated for long periods. Tram Drivers are located in an isolated area of the tram to which passengers have no access. Bus Drivers are the first point of contact for those entering the bus by reason of their location within the bus. While protective screening is provided on board busses, it is not possible to isolate Drivers completely from the traveling public.
- 25.3. It is a notorious fact that Bus Drivers can be subjected to abuse and assault in the course of their employment. While it appears that such incidents are rare, the possibility, albeit not frequently encountered, of assault remains a hazard associated with bus driving that relates to the conditions under which they perform their work.
- 25.4 Table A, below shows the number of Bus Drivers subjected to physical assault in the course of their employment in each of the years from 2014 to 2019 to-date. Table B shows the total number of assaults, including verbal abuse, suffered by Bus Drivers in the course of their employment.
- 25.5. While this is a matter of relevance in terms of working conditions, it is also a health and safety hazard and is taken into account in considering that topic.

Table A

2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019 to Date
62	59	63	65	68	30

Table B

2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019 to Date
92	107	104	109	109	54

25.6. I have concluded that the conditions under which a Bus Driver performs his or her job are more arduous than those of a Tram Driver

26. Other Features of the Respective Roles

26.1. The Terms of reference require me to consider documentation in relation to other aspects of the respective roles. The outcome of my consideration of these documents is set out hereunder.

27. Recruitment Process

27.1. From the documents with which I was provided, it appears that the recruitment process for a Bus Driver is more extensive than that in the case of a Tram Driver.

27.2. This criterion applies more vigorously in the case of Bus Drivers

28. Educational Requirements

28.1. The job description of a Light Rail Tram Driver specifies that candidates for appointment to that role must hold a Leaving Certificate. No minimum educational qualification is prescribed in the case of Dublin Bus Drivers.

28.2. On this criterion, a higher minimum educational requirement applies to Tram Drivers

29. Health Standards

- 29.1 Both Dublin Bus Drivers and Light Rail Tram Drivers are required to undergo a full pre-employment medical assessment. They are both required to remain medically fit during the currency of their employment.
- 29.2 From the information made available to me, there is nothing to indicate any material difference in the standard of medical fitness required for either role.
- 29.3. **On this criterion, there is no material difference as between both roles**

30. Licence Requirements

- 30.1. A Bus Driver must hold a category D licence throughout the continuance of their employment. That necessitates the licence holder obtaining a CPC and its renewal annually.
- 30.2. Tram Drivers are required to hold a category 'B' licence.
- 30.3 **On this criterion, the licence requirements associated with bus driving are greater than those associated with driving a tram.**

31. Training Period

- 31.1. The formal initial training period for a Tram Driver (8 weeks) is longer than that of a Bus Driver (4 or 6 weeks, depending on whether the individual already holds a category 'D' licence). However, when account is taken of the mentoring programme applicable to a Bus Driver, the training periods are at least equal.
- 31.2. **On this criterion, the duration of training for a Tram Driver and a Bus Driver are at least equal.**

32. Training Topics

- 32.1. The Modular Training programme for Bus Drivers consists of 13 different modules providing training on all aspects of driving and customer care skills. From my examination of the documents relating to

the training of each category, it appears that the training programme for a Bus Driver covers a wider range of topics.

32.2. On this criterion, the range of topics covered in the training of a Bus driver is greater than that covered by a Tram Driver

33. Ongoing Annual Training

33.1. Bus Drivers undergo ongoing annual training directed at maintaining their Certificate of Professional Competency (CPC). They also undergo a driving skills competence development programme once every two years.

33.2. Tram Drivers receive a one day refresher training course each year.

33.3. There are other training facilities available to both categories, which are provided where needed.

33.4. On this criterion, I have concluded that, overall, the ongoing training requirements for a Bus Driver are marginally greater than in the case of a Tram Driver.

34. Legal Requirements

34.1. Both bus driving and tram driving comes within the ambit of the Road Traffic Acts. In addition, tram driving is encompassed by the Railway Safety Act 2005, as amended. This Act places stringent obligations on Tram Drivers, a contravention of which can have consequences in relation to their employment, but also can give rise to personal liability in criminal law. Bus Drivers are required to observe the Rules of the Road in the course of their driving. As trams travel on the public road, tram driving is also subject to those Rules. However, given the different nature of bus driving and tram driving, it appears that their practical relevance is significantly greater in the case of bus driving.

34.2. On this criterion, I have concluded that, overall, the legal requirements which Bus Drivers and Tram Drivers are required to observe, while different, are equally vigorous.

35. Penalty Points / Insurance Risks

- 35.1 As both categories of driver are subject to the Road Traffic Acts, they can, potentially at least, incur penalty points in the course of their employment, with consequent implications for their private driving.
- 35.2. I have not been furnished with any information concerning the actual instances of penalty points accrued in the course of employment by either category. Intuitively, for reasons already mentioned, it would appear that the potentiality for accruing penalty points is greater in the case of Bus Drivers.
- 35.3. On this criterion, I have concluded that the potential to accrue penalty points is greater in the case of Bus Drivers than in the case of Tram Drivers**

36. Health Effects

- 36.1. At paragraphs 20.1.to 20.6. the conclusions of a report published by the ILO in 1996, entitled 'Bus Drivers: Occupational stress and stress prevention, by Professor M.A.J. Kompier, of the University of Mijmegem are detailed. This report shows that bus driving is a high risk occupation which can impact adversely on the physical and psychological well-being of those following that occupation. As stated at par 20.5., in the period since this report was published (1996) many initiatives have been taken by Dublin Bus to address and ameliorate the issues identified.
- 36.2. I have not seen any documentation in relation to stress and health issues affecting Tram Drivers. Many factors that can give rise to stress and health issues generally, are common to both categories, such as the need to keep to strict timetables and musculo-skeletal problems associated with remaining seated for long periods. In the case of Bus Drivers, an added stress factor can arise from interaction with customers and having to deal with difficult or troublesome passengers. Tram Drivers do not interact with customers to the same extent.
- 36.3. Of relevance here also, is the danger of assault, either physical, verbal or both, being inflicted on a Bus Driver in the course of his or her employment (see Tables A and B, at par 25.5.). Apart from the obvious

physical trauma that this can cause, the possibility of such an occurrence can also cause stress and anxiety.

- 36.4. On this criterion, in the absence of any published study of the stress and health effects of tram driving, I am unable to reach any definitive conclusions on the comparative hazards associated with each occupation. However, as a matter of probability, I would be inclined to the view that the job of a Bus Driver, is more stressful and can be more hazardous from a health perspective.**

37. Overall Conclusion

- 37.1 From my assessment, particularised above, I have come to the overall conclusion that the role of a Bus Driver can properly be classified as being of greater value to that of a Light Rail Tram Driver.**

Part 3

38. Pay and Conditions of Employment

- 38.1 The pay structure applicable to Bus Drivers is substantially different to that applicable in the case of Light Rail Drivers.
- 38.2. The rates payable to Bus Drivers are expressed as weekly amounts. There are separate rates applicable to those contracted to work a 4 day week. Bus Drivers have a 6 point incremental scale. Their pay comprises a basic rate and a shift payment. There is also provision for additional pay for Sunday working.
- 38.3 In the case of Light Rail Tram Drivers, pay is expressed as an annual salary. A nine point incremental scale applies with a long service increment applicable after three years at the highest point of the scale. The rates payable to Tram Drivers are in the form of an all-inclusive composite salary. There are no additional payments in respect of shift working, working unsocial hours and working on Sundays and Public holidays.

39. Overtime

- 39.1 In both categories, overtime working attracts additional payments. In the case of Bus Drivers, pay for overtime is expressed as a fixed amount, depending on its duration and the day of the week on which it is worked. In the case of Tram Drivers a more conventional arrangement applies and a premium on the basic rate is paid.

40. Sunday Premium / Rostering Arrangements

40.1. Bus Drivers are paid a premium for working on Sundays amounting to a double days' pay. Liability for rostered work on Sundays is reflected in the composite rate paid to Tram Drivers. Bus Drivers are rostered on a five week cycle which contains two Sundays for those on the 'senior cycle' and one Sunday for those on the junior cycle .

40.2. The order of rotas is as follows.

1. New drivers are placed on the 4 day week roster and are regarded as spare for rostering.
2. After approx. 1 year they are moved up on to the Junior cycle (1 Sunday per cycle) spare for rostering based on seniority.
3. When a slot becomes available on the senior cycle they are moved onto that roster spare for rostering based on seniority.

Spare for rostering means the driver will only know the duty /start and finish time 2 days in advance.

Vacant driver duties are advertised citywide every 2 months.

Drivers apply on the basis of seniority and if successful are marked in on the route of their choice based on seniority.

All main rota rosters work the Senior cycle (2 Sundays per cycle).

Very senior drivers can also apply to work Monday to Friday rosters if available or bogie duties all based on seniority.

40.3. A comparison of pay for Bus Drivers and Tram Drivers is set out at Table 1

41. Working Hours

41.1. Both Bus Drivers and Tram Drivers have a standard 39 hour week rostered on 5 days over 7.

42. Bonus

- 42.1 Tram Drivers receive an annual bonus of up to 6.5% of salary, if certain conditions are met in relation to performance and attendance.. €500 of the bonus is paid in the form of vouchers. Bus drivers receive a maximum bonus of €500 per year subject to meeting the eligibility criteria for safe driving and attendance.

43. Annual Leave

- 43.2. Annual Leave entitlements are broadly similar for both categories. Both have a basic entitlement of 20 days per year, with additional days allocated based on service. In the case of Bus Drivers, additional days are allocated after five, seven and ten years' service.
- 42.3. In the case of Tram Drivers additional days are provided after three, five and 10 years' service with additional annual leave, with a maximum of 24 days annual leave

44. Maternity Leave, Paternity Leave

- 44.1. Bus Drivers receive 3 days paid Paternity Leave. 26 weeks Maternity Leave is provided at full pay less social welfare payments. Adoptive Leave is provided at full pay less social welfare benefit, for 26 weeks.
- 44.2. Tram Drivers are entitled to 3 days paid Paternity Leave. Maternity leave is at full pay, less social welfare payments, for the first seven weeks and the next seven weeks is paid at half pay, less social welfare.

45. Pensions

- 45.1. Bus Drivers are enrolled in a Defined Benefit Pension Scheme (C.I.E Pension Scheme for Regular Wages Staff). This is a statutory scheme, the detailed rules of which are provided for by the Minister for Transport pursuant to section 44(4) of the Transport Act 1950. It is a contributory scheme, and as a Defined Benefit Scheme the Company are responsible for maintaining funding to the level necessary to meet the benefits provided for by the scheme. It includes provision for a surviving spouse's pension and dependent children's' benefits in the event of either death in service or during retirement, provided the employee is enrolled in the

Spouses and Children's scheme (which included the vast majority of Bus Drivers).

- 45.2. Tram Drivers are covered by a defined contribution pension scheme with a contribution of 5% of pay made by both the employee and the employer. There is also provision for a surviving spouses pension in the event of death in service.

46. Death in Service

- 46.1. The Dublin Bus Welfare Scheme provides for a death in service lump sum payable to a deceased employee's estate which is based on 3/80ths of annual basic pay for each year of service. This is subject to a minimum payment equal to one years' pay and a maximum of 1.5 years pay. In addition, a surviving spouse receives a pension of up to half of the pension that the deceased employee would have received had he or she retired at age 65, for those enrolled in the Spouses and Children's Scheme.
- 46.2. A Death in Service Benefit is payable to a surviving spouse on the death of a Tram Driver, equal to three times their basic salary,

47. Sickness Benefit / Welfare Scheme

- 47.1. Sickness benefits are provided to both Bus Drivers and Tram Drivers. In Dublin Bus, all employees are covered by a comprehensive welfare scheme. They are also covered by a jointly funded scheme which provides free access to a General Practitioner for the employee, the employee's spouse / partner and dependent children up to age 16. The major cost of this scheme is borne by the Company and employees make a weekly contribution of €1.80. This also includes an occupational injury scheme.
- 47.2. Bus Drivers have an entitlement to sick pay, as follows: -
- 100% of basic weekly wage for the first four weeks of illness
 - 70% of basic weekly wage for the next eight weeks of illness
 - 60% of basic wage for the next fourteen weeks of illness

In all cases the amounts payable are less State social welfare benefits.

47.3. Tram Drivers are not paid in respect of the first three days of illness. Thereafter, they are entitled to:-

- Full pay for seven weeks
- Half-pay for a further 26 weeks

In all cases the amounts payable are less State social welfare entitlements.

47.4. In the case of absence from work due to a workplace accident, the first three days are paid at full pay, less social welfare payments, and full pay continues to apply for fourteen weeks. Thereafter, 50% of salary is payable for up to 26 weeks, less social welfare payments.

48. Assault Pay Scheme

48.1. Bus Drivers have the benefit of an Assault Pay Scheme, in the event of becoming incapacitated as a result of an assault in the course of their employment. This scheme provides for full payment, based on average earnings, for up to 26 weeks and a further 26 weeks' pay, at their normal five week average rate, excluding overtime and rest day work payments.

48.2. There is no corresponding arrangements for Tram Drivers.

49. Retirement on Health Grounds

49.1. A Bus Driver who is required to retire on grounds of ill health becomes entitled to a reduced pension for their lifetime

49.2. A Tram Driver who cannot continue working, due to incapacity, is entitled to half-pay, less social welfare benefits, up to age 65. This scheme applies after 26 weeks absence from work due to illness or incapacity.

50. Travel Concessions

50.1. Bus Drivers receive an Annual Travel Pass for Dublin Bus scheduled services.

50.2. They also become entitled to a Privilege Ticket Identity Card for themselves, their spouse and dependent children up to 25 years of age (in

full time education), which entitles the holder to unlimited reduced fares on the CIÉ rail system.

- 50.3. An employee's partner can be issued with a PTI card upon proof of them living together for at least 5 years
- 50.4. After 12 months continuous service Bus Drivers are entitled to 20 single trip passes per annum over CIÉ rail system for themselves, their spouse and dependent children up to 25 years of age (in full time education).
- 50.5. They are also entitled to two free Irish Ferries tickets per year and unlimited reduced rate tickets.
- 50.6. There is no corresponding benefit available to tram Drivers

A Comparison of employment benefits, other than core pay, for Bus Drivers and Tram Drivers is set out at Table 2

51. Pay

- 51.1. For the purpose of comparing the pay of both categories, the weekly rates applicable to Bus Drivers is taken as including shift pay and premium pay for Sunday working. The basic rate, plus shift pay, is adjusted by taking the average weekly rate, including the Sunday premium payable in respect of two Sundays in each five week cycle rota for those on a senior cycle rota. The average weekly rate for those on a junior five week cycle rota is taken as including the value of one Sunday premium over the five week cycle.**
- 51.2. For comparison purposes the composite annual salary applicable to Tram Drivers is divided by 52. In the table below, the right hand column indicates the total pay of a Tram Driver if the full 6.5% bonus is paid.**

Table 1 – Pay of Bus Drivers / Tram Drivers

Years	Bus Driver (Five day week Senior Cycle)	Bus Driver(5 day week Junior Cycle)	Tram Driver From 1/1/2019	Tram Driver (if full 6.5% bonus paid
On Induction	N/A		€605.33- €638.94	
1	€742.42	€722.35	€706.13	€765.10
2	€742.42	€722.35	€731.25	€778.77
3	€768.47	€747.70	€744.03	€792.40
4	€768.47	€747.70	€794.94	€846.61
5	€807.54	€785.71	€804.86	€857.17
6	€859.61	€836.38	€837.08	€892.78
7	€859.61	€836.38	€837.08	€892.78
8	€859.61	€836.38	€853.81	€909.30
9	€859.61	€836.38	€896.77	€955.06
LSI After 3 years at max of scale	N/A	N/A	€919.17	€978.92

Note:

The rates in respect to Light Rail Tram Drivers set out in this table were provided for in Labour Court Recommendation LCR21241, issued on 30th May 2016. That Recommendation, which was accepted by all parties, made provision for phased increases in Driver rates up to 1/9/20. When that recommendation is fully implemented, the salary applicable to Tram Drivers will go from €32,909 (induction rate) to €49,972 (long service increment)

52. Light Rail Tram Drivers Bonus Scheme

52.2. The bonus scheme applicable to Transdev staff, including Drivers, is provided for by a collective agreement concluded with SIPTU in 2009. The bonus is conditional on individuals meeting certain Key Performance Indicators. These relate to: -

- Maintaining industrial peace
- Performance
- Attendance
- Timekeeping

52.3. Under the agreement, assessments are undertaken of each individual covered by the scheme on a quarterly basis. The bonus earned in each quarter is protected but the full annual bonus is paid in a single lump sum annually.

Table 2: Employment Conditions and Benefits (Other than Core Pay and Overtime)

Benefits	Bus Driver	Tram Driver
Sunday Premium	Double Day's Pay	None
Working Hours	39 Hours	39 Hours
Overtime	Various fixed payments related to point on incremental scale and when overtime is worked	<p>Overtime on weekday First 4 hours = Time +1/2, time x 2 thereafter</p> <p>Work weekday rest day = Time +1/2</p> <p>Work Sunday rest day = Time x 2</p> <p>Overtime on Rostered Sunday = Time x 2</p> <p>Rostered overtime on Public Holiday = Time x 2</p>

Annual Leave	23? After 10 years	24 after 10 years
Maternity Leave /	26 weeks full pay (less S/W	7 weeks full pay (less S/W 7weeks half-pay (less S/W
Paternity Leave	3 days full pay	3 days full pay
Pensions	C.I.E Defined Benefit Scheme. Pension based on service and final salary	Defined Contribution Scheme. Pension determined by accrual of individual fund
Death in Service	Related to service, maximum of 1.5 times annual salary. Spouses pension under C.I.E pensions scheme	Final basic salary x 3
Sickness Benefit / Welfare Scheme	100% of pay for 4 weeks 70% of pay for 8 weeks 60% of pay for 14 weeks Access to GP for employee, spouse and children	First 3 days Zero 100% of pay for 7 weeks 50% of pay for 26 weeks
Assault Pay	100% of average earnings for 26 weeks 100% of average 5 week rota pay (less overtime) for 26 weeks	Not Applicable
Income Continuance	A reduced pension is payable to those retired on grounds of ill health	50% of pay up to age 65. Applicable after 26 weeks absence through illness.
Travel Concessions	Free travel for employee, spouse,	Not applicable

	partner and children on bus and rail network
	Concessions on Irish Ferries

53. Conclusion in Relation to Pay and Conditions

- 53.1. My terms of reference do not require me to provide an analysis of the total comparative value of the package of pay and benefits available to Bus Drivers vis-à-vis those available to Tram Drivers. From the information set out in this report there clearly are differences in the various components of the overall employment package available to each category. The extent to which more advantageous benefits in one category may offset, or compensate for, less advantageous benefits in another category is a matter of opinion, which frequently turns on the value placed on the benefit in question by the recipient. However, for the sake of completeness, the following observations can be made.
- 53.2. It appears that the totality of the pay package available to Tram Drivers is higher than that available to Bus Drivers, particularly in the case of those with long service. This is primarily accounted for by the availability of a 6.5% bonus payable to Tram Drivers and a longer incremental scale, including a Long Service Increment (LSI). In this connection it should be noted that payment of the bonus is conditional and therefore, not guaranteed. It is not regarded as basic pay and is neither pensionable nor reckonable for sick pay purposes.
- 53.3. The defined pension scheme in which Bus Drivers are enrolled is materially superior to the defined contribution scheme applicable to Tram Drivers. Welfare benefits available to Bus Drivers are also more advantageous than those available to Tram Drivers. This is particularly so having regard to the availability to the former group of a free GP service for the employee, his or her spouse or partner and dependent children.

- 53.4. Pay in respect of maternity leave is also significantly better in the case of Bus Drivers than in the case of Tram Drivers, while pay in respect of paternity leave is the same for both categories.
- 53.5. The travel concessions available to Bus Drivers and their families are also a material benefit that is not available to their counterparts in the Light Rail service.

Part 4

Summary of Conclusions

Having conducted my examination of the role of a Bus Driver in comparison to that of a Light Rail Tram Driver, I have reached the following conclusions: -

- **Bus Drivers are required to exercise a higher level of driving skill than that required for tram driving. This is indicated by the requirement on Bus Drivers to hold a category 'D' licence and to hold a CPC.**
- **Both Bus Drivers and Tram Drivers are required to use on-board technology in the course of their work. I have concluded that the skills required to exercise these functions are equal as between both categories**
- **The skills required in identifying and reporting defects in the vehicles that they drive are equal as between both categories**
- **The mental requirements inherent in the role of a Bus Driver are greater than those inherent in the role of a Tram Driver**
- **The range and nature of responsibilities attaching to the role of a Bus Driver are greater than those attaching to the role of a Tram Driver**
- **The conditions under which a Bus Driver performs his or her job are more arduous than those of a Tram Driver**
- **There is a more vigorous recruitment process in the case of Bus Drivers than in the case of Tram Drivers**
- **A higher minimum educational requirement applies to Tram Drivers than in the case of Bus Drivers**
- **There is no material difference in the minimum health standards as between both roles**

- The licence requirements associated with bus driving are greater than those associated with driving a tram.
- The duration of training for a Tram Driver for a Tram Driver and a Bus Driver are at least equal.
- The range of topics covered in the training of a Bus driver is greater than that covered by a Tram Driver
- The overall ongoing training requirements for a Bus Driver are marginally greater than in the case of a Tram Driver.
- The legal requirements which Bus Drivers and tram Drivers are required to observe, while different, are equally vigorous
- The potential to accrue penalty points is greater in the case of Bus Drivers than in the case of Tram Drivers
- In the absence of any published study of the stress and health effects of tram driving, I am unable to reach any definitive conclusions on the comparative hazards associated with each occupation. However, as a matter of probability, I would be inclined to the view that the job of a Bus Driver, is more stressful and can be more hazardous from a health perspective.

I have come to the overall conclusion that the role of a Bus Driver can properly be classified as being of greater value to that of a Light Rail Tram Driver.

Pay and Conditions of Employment

- There are differences in the various components of the overall employment package available to each category.
- The extent to which more advantageous benefits in one category may offset, or compensate for, less advantageous benefits in another category is a matter of opinion, which frequently turns on the value placed on the benefit in question by the recipient.

- **The totality of the pay package available to Tram Drivers is higher than that available to Bus Drivers, particularly in the case of those with long service. This is primarily accounted for by the availability of a 6.5% bonus payable to Tram Drivers and a longer incremental scale, including a Long Service Increment (LSI). In this connection, it should be noted that payment of the bonus is conditional and therefore, not guaranteed. It is not regarded as basic pay and is neither pensionable nor reckonable for sick pay purposes.**
- **The defined pension scheme in which Bus Drivers are enrolled is materially superior to the defined contribution scheme applicable to Tram Drivers. Welfare benefits available to Bus Drivers are also more advantageous than those available to Tram Drivers. This is particularly so having regard to the availability to the former group of a free GP service for the employee, his or her spouse or partner and dependent children.**
- **Pay in respect of maternity leave is also significantly better in the case of Bus Drivers than in the case of Tram Drivers, while pay in respect of paternity leave is the same for both categories.**
- **The travel concessions available to Bus Drivers and their families are also a material benefit that is not available to their counterparts in the Light Rail service.**

Kevin Duffy
3rd September 2019

